



State of California
Governor's Office of Planning and Research

California Joint Land Use Studies (JLUS), Beale AFB

Advisory Committee Meeting Notes

Advisory Committee Meeting #4
Yuba County Government Center
November 2, 2006
1:30 pm – 4:00 pm

ATTENDANCE

Advisory Committee

Ed Ah Sam Beale Air Force Base, 9th Civil Engineer Squadron
Tina Bartlett..... California Department of Fish and Game
Robert Bendorf..... Yuba County Office of the County Administrator
Mike Darnell Middle Mountain Foundation
Mary Frederick California Department of Transportation
Darin Gale North State Building Industry Association
Scott Greeley Yuba County
John Miller..... Yuba City
Kent Nakata City of Lincoln
John Nicoletti..... Yuba County Board of Supervisors
Laura Nicholson Yuba-Sutter Chamber of Commerce
Harl Sanderson Beale Air Force Base, 9th Reconnaissance Wing
Hal Stocker..... Yuba County Board of Supervisors
Richard Thomas..... Sierra Club
Benjamin Wirtschafter..... City of Marysville

Project Team

Ned McKinley Governor's Office of Planning and Research
Julia Lave Johnston Governor's Office of Planning and Research
Jennifer Driemeyer..... Governor's Office of Planning and Research
Chris Kinne..... Governor's Office of Planning and Research
Rick Rust..... Matrix Design Group

I. Welcome and Introductions

A. Welcome

As stated at the first public workshop, the Advisory Committee meetings are open to the public to observe. While there will not be a public comment period, comment cards are available for public input. The Governor's Office of Planning and Research (OPR) Staff is also available in the back of the room to answers any questions or take down any comments public participants may have.

B. Governor's Office of Planning and Research (OPR), Beale JLUS Team

- Ned McKinley, JLUS Project Manager
- Julia Lave Johnston, Senior Planner and Beale JLUS Task Manager. (Questions regarding the Beale JLUS should be directed to her.)
- Terry Roberts, Director of the State Clearinghouse (not in attendance)
- Jennifer Driemeyer, Administrative Assistant for Military Projects
- Chris Kinne, Project Team Member

C. Matrix Design Group (Project Consultants)

- Rick Rust, California JLUS Project Manager, Beale JLUS Task Manager

D. Advisory Committee Meeting #4 Agenda

- Compatibility Planning Case Study: Sean Quinn from the City of Fairfield will speak about the collaboration between his City and Travis Air Force Base.
- Compatibility Factors
- Next Steps

II. Project Update

A. Overview of Public Forum (August 9, 2006)

- Approximately 40 people from the public and Advisory/Technical Committees attended.
- The forum consisted of a presentation about the project, an open house that allowed one-on-one discussions, and facilitated group exercises.
- The group exercises focused on four questions. The minutes from the Public Forum were provided to the AC members so that they could review all of the responses. The following overview of the facilitated group discussions was provided:
 - **Question #1.** What do you feel are future and current encroachment factors and which factors are currently adequately addressed?
 - Current encroachment factors: Roadways (access, maintenance, and gate closures), land space/compatibility, local housing availability, and air quality.
 - Future encroachment factors: Airspace and communications (e.g., frequency impedance, and interference).
 - Adequately addressed encroachment factors: Endangered species.
 - Not applicable: Alternative energy.
 - **Question #2.** What compatibility issues should the JLUS address?
 - Land use/compatibility
 - Roadways
 - Environmental concerns
 - **Question #3.** What is your vision for your community in twenty years?
 - Maintain a small-town feel
 - More diverse, sustainable economy
 - Buffer zone around the base

- **Question #4.** How do you feel about limiting development around Beale to prevent encroachment?
 - Wide range of answers
 - Majority felt that commercial development around the base would be acceptable, but the needs of the base should be addressed so its mission could be preserved.

B. Overview of Technical Committee Meeting #4

- TC met on September 13, 2006.
- The TC reviewed materials on compatibility issues and tools to address these issues.

III. **Compatibility Planning Examples: City of Fairfield and Travis AFB (presented by Sean Quinn, City of Fairfield)**

A. Background

- Fairfield has been dealing with compatible land use planning issues for over sixteen years.
- Travis AFB is located inside the Fairfield city limits on the I-80 corridor.
- Travis AFB is the largest employer for the city and county.
 - Contributes over \$1 billion to local economy.
- Strong local commitment to protect and enhance Travis AFB.
 - Solano County has dealt with closures of other bases.
 - There is a large population of retired military personnel near Travis AFB.
- 1990: City initiated new General Plan update.
- 1992: Adopted General Plan – included 10,000 future dwelling units north of Travis AFB.
 - Noise standard of 65 CNEL for residential development.
- 1995: General Plan amended: Reduced units to 7,800 and added a 1,400 acre industrial park on the border of the base.
- 2002: Specific Plan amendment: Eliminated all residential development; industrial park was to be moved to the west and was reduced to 800 acres.
 - Noise standard was reduced to 60 CNEL for maximum mission.
- Travis Reserve: Only to be used for expansion of the Air Force Base or if the mission changes. It could be used for commercial airport use.
 - Proposition passed for urban development in the city, not the county.
- 2002: Travis Protection Element
 - Future development should not conflict with viability of Travis AFB.
 - Notify Travis of proposed development.
 - Establish a reserve of land to be set aside for expansion of Travis AFB.
- Measure L requires vote of Fairfield residents to:
 - Change urban limit line
 - Change noise standard
 - Change Travis Reserve

B. Wilcox Ranch

- 2002: City and county purchased 1,858 acres from Nature Conservancy for \$1.3 million.
- Deed restriction limiting use of property to agricultural uses and prohibits construction or improvements on the property unless used for air facility expansion.
- Travis AFB, the Nature Conservancy, and local land trust are working together on Department of Defense Buffer Program proposal.
- Wilcox Ranch is parallel to the runway.

C. Travis Community Consortium

- Includes all seven cities in Solano County, Solano County, Solano Economic Development Services, Solano College, and Travis AFB.
- Prepared Travis Enhancement Strategy.
- Adopted joint-resolution in support of base.
- Provide affordable housing.
- Lobby for new projects: support military construction projects, aircraft modernization and acquisition (C-17s), new tower, and new facilities.
- Support/advocate for new missions.
- Support/advocate at local, state, and federal level.
- Quarterly meeting between Travis AFB and City Planning/Engineering staff.

D. Questions from AC Members

- How many acres are within the Travis Reserve?
 - About 4,000 acres
 - 1,800 of the acres are within Wilcox Ranch.
- How many housing units are on base?
 - About 1,200
 - Base relies on community to provide housing.
- How many people work on base?
 - 14,000 military, civilian, and reservists
 - Large Reservists use on weekends outstripped the supply of hotels rooms in area. New 300 room facility was built on base. Base worked with local hotels to ensure existing facilities were not adversely impacted. The reservists use hotels off base in the region (usually will go to Fairfield, Vacaville, and Sacramento).
- How big is Travis AFB?
 - Mr. Quinn did not have an exact number.
 - There are high schools, middle schools, and elementary schools used by children of base personnel. Some of the schools are on base, others, such as the high school, are located in the community.
 - The distance from the airfield to the community is approximately 3 miles.
 - Travis AFB has the largest air mobility wing in the U.S.
- Is there a critical mission other than flying?
 - The base has several support missions, a large hospital, and a Navy facility for communication with submarines.
- Who owns the Travis Reserve area?
 - City owns half.
- Are most of the restrictions voter mandated?
 - Yes; however, there were pro and con stakeholder groups:
 - Slow growth, environmentalists, and the retired population
 - Landowners and developers

E. Beale AFB

- Discussions between the county and base should be ongoing. They should make an agreement to decide the best location of housing and hotels.

IV. Compatibility Factors

A. Defining factors that should be included in the JLUS

- Existing conditions, demographics, etc.
- Identify encroachment/compatibility factors in each jurisdiction.
- Discuss tools to address the encroachment/compatibility issues.

B. Tools for Addressing Encroachment Factors and Prioritizing Strategies (a handout was passed out: Table 2, Strategy Prioritization Matrix)

- Review key issues under each of the encroachment challenges, which are based on the following OPR publication:
 - The *California Advisory Handbook for Community and Military Compatibility Planning (Handbook)* has a list of encroachment tools with more detailed explanations of information provided in the handouts. The *Handbook* is available online at www.opr.ca.gov. Copies are also available on CD. (If you would like one, contact Julia Lave Johnston, Project Task Manager at (916) 445-0613.)
 - Input from the workshops.
- Confirm/modify key issues and their impact areas
- Identify key tools that are appropriate for the area

C. Overview of Compatibility Factors (See attachment.)

To help start the discussion, Mr. Rust provided a brief definition, with examples, of each of the strategy types presented on Table 2.

- BASH (Bird Aircraft Strike Hazard)
 - Strike hazards related to wildlife and birds
- Building Code
 - Regulations to reduce military activity conflicts with buildings (such as regulations on sound attenuation)
- Capital Improvement Program
 - Funding, road expenses, new gates or closure of old gates.
- Cluster Development
 - Land use regulation that allows residential units to be clustered in a small area of a project, with the remainder of the project site remaining as open space.
- Code Enforcement
 - Elimination of nuisances that impact operations at Beale AFB.
- Communication Outreach
 - Communication between the base and the community; education.
- Condemnation
 - Eminent Domain
- Conditional Use Permit
 - Regulation of land uses, due to type or location, that require additional conditions to ensure compatibility (such as location and height of cell phone towers)
- Conservation Easement
 - Tool that can be used to modify development potential while maintaining current uses of property and providing compensation to the property owner. Can be done in connection with a transfer development rights (TDR) program.
- Conservation Partnering Authority
 - Formal agreement between agencies, organizations, and others to provide funding for conservation, such as setting up conservation easements
- Deed Restrictions
 - Voluntary restrictions on the use of property. For instance, new subdivisions can place restrictions on the use of a property (such as no new construction in a certain portion of the lot) that stays with the property and transfers to future owners.
- Development Notification Process
 - Formal process to provide notification to interested parties (such as Beale AFB) of proposed projects.
- Dust Control Ordinance
 - Concern for maintaining visibility around base
- Easement Acquisition

- Acquisition of certain rights from a property owner (with compensation), such as a roadway access or an aviation easement (an easement that can be used to secure right-of-flight, restriction on certain uses, etc.).
- Electrical Interference Ordinance
 - Ordinance that sets standards relative to uses that produce electrical interference (could also address impedance) or are near sources of existing interference. An example includes a cell phone tower ordinance (clustering).
- Flexible Air Quality Permits
 - Preservation of clean air
- General Plans
 - Per recent state legislation, requires General Plan updates or revisions to consider military compatibility issues
- Habitat Conservation Tools
 - Tools such as the NCCP/HCP process currently happening for portions of Yuba and Sutter Counties
- Habitat Loss Tracking
 - Concern that the base is the last refuge for wildlife – look at the issue regionally, rather than on a case-by-base basis to preserve time.
- Interim Planning Overlay District
 - Short term use of an overlay district that applies land use regulations to a specific area (areas that need protection).
- Land Exchange
 - Arrange for an exchange of land (such as trading land near the base for land away from the base that is better suited for development).
- Memorandum of Understanding
 - A formal agreement between agencies, organizations, and others of common interest, such as an agreement to follow the guidance in the JLUS.
- Military Corridor Overlay District
 - Designation of a corridor used by the military that requires specific protections or conditions
- Military Influence Area (MIA)
 - Specific areas near a military installation that have additional regulations concerning incompatible uses. Could be a type of overlay zone.
- Outdoor Lighting/Glare Standards
 - Restrictions, usually in a zoning code, that place requirements on lightings (such as type, location, intensity, shielding, etc.)
- Partnerships with NGOs (non-governmental organizations)
 - Working with organizations to achieve a common interest, such as land trusts, for the purchase of conservation easements
- Programmatic Biological Option
 - Habitat Conservation Plan
 - Rules to move forward on development (regionally), while still preserving habitat
- Real Estate Disclosure
 - Require a new homeowner to sign a notification if located next to uses that could be annoyances (such as disclosure to new home owners about nearby agricultural operations, aircraft overflight, etc.)
- Red/Yellow/Green Map
 - Kern County uses this system to show where energy windmills are suitable, potentially suitable, or not suitable based on military operations.
- State Investment Policies
 - State investment, such as the location of highways and interchanges, can influence growth trends and growth locations
- Subdivision Ordinance
 - Ordinance maintained by cities and counties that prescribes the subdivision of land.
- Tailored Compatibility Guidelines
 - Development guidelines that can supplement zoning to further define controls, such as heights or frequency near an airport

- Telecommunications Ordinance
 - Ordinance targeted at the safe location and operation of telecommunication facilities
- Voluntary Acquisition Program
 - Land owner's voluntary participation in protections, such as donation of land, volunteering for a conservation easement, etc.

D. Study Area Map

- Illustrates new study area boundary.
 - New study area covers a 15 mile radius centered on the runway. This allows it to capture:
 - Overflight issues
 - Old/new noise contours
 - Urbanized areas
 - Lincoln Airport
 - Rural impacts in Nevada County
 - Old Camp Beale
 - AC agreed with proposed study area boundary as the basis for the JLUS

V. Next Steps

A. Action Items

- Please discuss the topics presented at the AC/TC meetings with your organization or constituency. AC/TC members should meet to discuss updates to the study.

B. Next Steps

- Next TC meeting will be in December. The TC will review the tools that could be used to address identified compatibility factors in each impacted community

V. Comments

A. Some AC members stated that the public believes that the Joint Land Use Study will keep the base open.

- Yuba County is hesitant to approve any EIRs before the JLUS is released.
- Hope to speed up the study in order to meet the needs of the community.
 - OPR clarified that the JLUS will not address specific development projects or be able to quantify some impacts where information is not already available.
 - The public draft will be released in February with a 30-day review period. The final study should be released soon after the review period has closed.

B. The base has asked for permission to measure radio interference related to the PAVEPAWS facility on the six parcels of land that are adjacent. This includes parcels within Yuba Highlands.

- If access is allowed, the study it will provide an update to the August 1993 study on PAVEPAWS.